

5. How are trainers qualified?

Who determines the training contents for trainers and how are these contents found?

There exists no specific standardization or regulation in this field in Turkey. However, there is a crucial need for trainers to have a deep knowledge of the enterprise, products and production processes in addition to their basic skills and knowledge. Moreover, they need to pass through a comprehensive orientation programme. Legal arrangements should be done in order to make it compulsory for trainers in Industrial Vocational High Schools and Post-Secondary Vocational High Schools to deliver trainings in the enterprises, while private enterprises should be encouraged in this way.

Major difficulties faced by trainers concerning content in enterprises are as follows:

- Diversity of levels concerning the skills and competences of the trainees
- Necessity for renewing the vocational and technical training contents due to frequent changes in technology
- The need for development of vocational and technical training sets that do not exist in the market
- Problems arising from the implementation of vocational and technical training programmes sent by foreign VET institutions without assessing their appropriateness to the local and sectoral conditions and differences.

Which institutions are incorporated in the training of trainers and how do they cooperate?

Vocational Education Centers providing pedagogical training for masters (delivering master-trainer certificates) in scope of apprenticeship training are under the responsibility of MoNE. On the other hand, Higher Education Council regulates procedures and issues concerning Technical Training Faculties. However, it is hard to claim that there is an effective and efficient cooperation between these two governmental bodies with respect to organization of training of trainers in vocational education and training.

From another point, for those who non-formally acquire training competences in their sector there does not exist any mechanisms to certify their skills and qualifications. There are many private education institutions delivering training of trainers programs, but diplomas or certificates taken from these institutions are not recognised by MoNE and HEC.

According to our interviewees, the profession of being a trainer and its certification should be taken from the monopolistic hands of Ministry of National Education and Turkish Council of Higher Education and an internationally accredited examination and certification system should be introduced. Furthermore, the barriers before developing oneself's technical trainer competences without the obligation of graduating from Technical Education Faculties or making post-graduate study in faculty of science should be removed. As it is legally prevented to make post-graduate study in VET without having a bachelor's degree in the same field, non-formal programs such as training of trainers should be organized for high level trainers in order to foster lifelong learning.

How do trainers acquire competences (theoretical and practical knowledge, work experience)?

Opportunities for trainers in enterprises concerning life-long learning and self-development are very scarce in our country. Private education institutions have limited sources and a narrow reach in VET due to the monopoly of Ministry of National Education (MoNE) and Higher Education Council (HEC) in the field. Caused by the formulaic rules

in our country, highly competent and professional trainers can not title themselves as trainers legally and can not certify their years long training experience and expertise in the relevant sector since they are not graduates of technical training faculties or do not have pedagogical formation, and due to the absence of a higher accreditation institution.

The importance given to lifelong learning in Turkey's accession process to the EU can be regarded as an opportunity. Throughout this period private training institutions in VET accredited by international institutions rather than MoNE or HEC should be supported and their scope should be widened. By this means trainers can certify their skills and competences, and professionalize. The recently ratified Law no. 5544 on Vocational Qualifications Authority is the most important step that has been taken in this scope. By means of establishing necessary mechanisms and implementing the relevant regulations sub-commissions where sector representatives will have a say should be formed and activated.

Which certificates can be gained, in which duration?

Individuals who participate in work pedagogy courses after receiving mastership qualification are given a "Master Trainer Certificate". These individuals have the right to give practical training at enterprises to apprentices and vocational and technical education students.

On the other hand, those graduating from 4-year Technical Training Faculties take Technical Trainer Diploma. Technical trainers have the right to give practical training at enterprises to apprentices and vocational and technical education students as well. The curriculum in technical training faculties is similar to that in engineering faculties' upto 65–70 per cent, and also there is more emphasis on production, problem-solving and product development. Besides the practice-oriented studies, technical trainer candidates take 48 working days industry apprenticeship training in factories during summer months. This is also very appreciated by industrialists in manufacturing sector. Technical trainer candidates take pedagogical formation courses as well, by making instructor apprenticeship during 2 half-terms in theoretical and in vocational schools. As a result, they can act more positive, end-oriented, and engage in more constructive human relations.

How important is a formal qualification/certificate? Are qualifications/certificates internationally acknowledged?

Under the modernization of VET in Turkey, establishment of a National Qualifications System has been on the country's agenda for the past 10 years. Important work has been carried out with regard to the organization of the functions making up the National Qualifications System (tri-partite management, recognition of the qualifications, definition of the training standards, testing/assessment and certification procedures etc.) and the development of required tools (national qualifications/occupational standards, testing instruments, training programmes, training materials etc.).

Studies have been pursued in order to set up a National Qualifications System parallel with the EQF. In this respect, all parties and institutions including MoNE have been dealing with issues concerning legal framework of a Vocational Qualifications Authority (VQA). A draft law on the establishment of a VQA has been prepared by all the relevant stakeholders and has been recently ratified by the Turkish Grand National Assembly. The VQA, that was established on 7 October 2006, is an autonomous tri-partite national authority composed of the representatives of all relevant stakeholders and will be in charge of making national legislation required for qualifications; developing occupational and education standards; designing certification procedures; authorization of VET institutions and other organizations that provide VET and grant certificates.

As long as there is no internationally accredited examination system that people can manifest their proficiency, country will encounter loss of money and time with repetitive trainings and certificates that has not legal basis.

Which qualifications do those have that are responsible for the training of trainers and how do they acquire these qualifications?

As one of the interviewees emphasized, the education level of the expert teachers is very low; for example, in hotels the kitchen staff's education level is not above primary school level, and when it comes to the other staff, there is no connection between their positions in their work and the schools that they are trained in. For example, a graduate of an industrial vocational high school works as a captain of a restaurant, and a graduate of a high school of trade type works as a service staff. People that will be assigned as expert teachers should be furnished with the ability of using basic computer applications. The lowness of the education level reveals that a cook that claims himself as an expert, does not even know a very basic term such as protein.

Also, it is a common opinion shared by interviewees that trainers with high skills and competences should be encouraged about completing their bachelor's degrees. Moreover, new projects should be developed in order to overcome the foreign language problems of trainers. State supported crash foreign language courses should be organized in order to ensure that every trainer can speak at least one foreign language (English in particular) at a level to deliver seminars and trainings.

6. How is the reputation of trainers and how are they integrated in enterprises/society?

Which functions of social integration are fulfilled through the work and training of trainers?

The training workplaces where the training is done will be easily found in the enterprises. As a result of improvements in the competence and qualifications of the staff, the increase in the efficiency will be easily seen in a very short period of time and the acceleration in the position and respectability of the trainers will be visible. People, who like renewing themselves, reading and writing technology, will have this opportunity. The opportunity of financial strengthening of the trainers will eventually happen as they get professional. After a while, the opinions of these trainers will also be taken into account about the affairs, vision and mission of the enterprises.

How is the work of trainers recognised in enterprises and in the society?

Material and motivational appreciation, and support from the top management is highly deficient in Turkey which requires serious measures to be taken. On the other hand, though it has been stated that the competences and liabilities of technical trainers, whose entitlement is specified by the Law no. 3795, would be determined with a regulation related to the same Law, no progress has been made to this day due to various reasons. The most important reason, informally expressed by some of the members of Higher Education Council, is the pressure made on Higher Education Council by various chambers of engineers and some of the leading universities. This situation leads to great disappointment and fatigue among 200,000 technical trainers and especially among 30,000 recent graduates.

Moreover, the enterprises that have training units and expert teachers should be encouraged by the state because these units have the quality of schools. The state should search for the ways of satisfying the expert teachers that work in the vocational training

units in the enterprises, both financially and morally (Example: A symbolic amount of 50 cent per hour should be given to the trainers).

Which is the unemployment rate of trainers?

The rate of being appointed to vocational high schools after graduation by the Ministry of National Education (MoNE) declined to 5 per cent in the last 10–12 years whereas all graduates were being appointed before then right after graduation. As a result, there appeared an excess of supply due to the policies of MoNE and Higher Education Council. It has been realized that this problem should be immediately handled only after the implementation of EU Project called Strengthening of Vocational Education and Training System in Turkey that started in 2002 and is expected to finish in September 2007.

7. How innovative is the work and training of trainers?

How is the quality and efficiency of trainers' training assessed?

The evaluation of the training given at enterprises is done by the enterprises themselves. Teachers along with employer's representatives attend the examinations for journeyman-ship and mastership examinations under apprenticeship training. The representatives of employees are not in the exam commission.

The necessary precautions about the planning, implementation and evaluation of the vocational trainings in the enterprises are taken by the school director and the enterprise authority. Within the scope of their work and authority, the school director and enterprise authority are collectively responsible for the conduct of the training activities in accordance with the training curricula.

Is there research about the work and training of trainers and what does it suggest?

Modernisation of Vocational Education and Training in Turkey Project (MVET) funded by the European Union MEDA program started operating on 7 July 2003. The overall goal of the project was to further modernize and adapt the system to make vocational education and training more responsive to the socio-economic needs of the country and to the key principles of life-long learning.

The MVET PROJECT has a vital component in improving the quality and relevance of the Turkish Vocational Education Training (VET) system. The idea was that the upgrading of vocational and technical teacher training is a significant factor in the improvement of the overall VET system, and teachers in the VET system will need to carry out new functions and assume different roles. In order to do this, the system for training VET Teachers at both pre-service and in-service levels was planned to be adjusted to facilitate the development of teachers with appropriate competencies and relevant vocational experience. To facilitate assistance for these activities, five regional offices has been established.

Under the general project objective VET Teacher Training competencies were identified in 9 areas. Pre-service and in-service modular curricula were developed by taking the competencies as a reference. Six areas of competence based pre-service training curricula included in the project during the first phase started pilot implementation in 11 universities, 14 VET Teacher Training faculties in 2004–2005 academic year. The first two years of piloting the curricula have been completed. The following piloting programmes were included in the assessment: Computer, Automotive, Clothing, Ready-made Clothing.

***Which are weaknesses and strengths with respect to the training of trainers?
Where is a need for reform?***

Medium-sized enterprises that have facilities meet their training needs of staff and managers similarly with large scale enterprises. However, the owners of the micro and small sized enterprises have serious difficulties in meeting training needs of their managers. The difficulties of micro and small sized enterprises can be basically divided into two groups as problems emerging from supply and demand. In meeting of the training needs of the owners and managers of micro and small sized enterprises, the problems regarding demand are as follows: The demand for training activities of micro and small sized enterprises is quite low. It is thought that this result is an effect of the enterprises' unawareness regarding training needs and benefit of trainings.

Enterprises in Turkey generally do not have a separate training staff for in-company VET. Senior personnel also carrying the responsibilities of trainers consist of people whom the enterprise managers confide in with respect to training skills and qualifications. Trainers in enterprises are generally titled with their administrative and professional positions (service manager, department director, expert etc) rather than trainer. This phenomenon results in a situation where trainers are forced to change their fields since being a trainer in enterprises is not regarded as a profession and no pathways exist for career development. As long as it is required to get approval from institutions like MoNE and HEC in order to be recognized as trainer, it is impossible to expect qualified and competent personnel to be motivated about developing themselves as trainers. Thus, there is an unfortunate dilemma since active and professional trainers can not be accredited and recognized as trainers whereas those recruited as trainers in faculties can not be employed in sector.

Are there any 'good practice examples' at company or sectoral level?

Life-long learning activities that VET trainers in enterprises engage in for gaining a new vision, and new competences and qualifications. As they get familiar to new technologies, their self-reliance will increase, they will spread this know-how to their environment and they will be respected more by their fellows and managers in the enterprises that they work.

The major vision is the establishment of the necessary know-how management infrastructure, systems and processes that will enable the transfer, sharing and development of know-how accumulation to these system.

Training Academy established within Mercedes Benz-Turk A. is one of the best examples concerning in-company training system. In this academy, personnel responsible for the processes such as Quality, Kaizen, DaimlerChrysler Production System and Job Security are also providing training services in the areas on which they have expertise. Regarding the profile of these in-company trainers, it will be seen that they are competent, have expertise on their area, and coming from engineering backgrounds. Apart from this, there exist part-time and full-time technical instructors responsible for the training of blue-collar workers and apprentices.

As a result of the activities of Kaya Academy, another good practice example in Turkey, that have been established within Kaya Hotels and Resorts, the qualifications of the captains, floor chiefs and kitchen chiefs that work in Floor Services, Kitchen and Service Departments, has reached European standards and this staff trains the coming trainees as a monitor in certain modules. Also, when the other staff get the logic and essence of the work that they do, their efficiency in their work increases. It is planned that among the people that complete this training will take active role in preparing the Occupational Standards in scope of the regulations to be executed under the brand new National Institute of Vocational Qualifications established by the Law no. 5544.

Other good practice examples are as follows:

- **Isisan Heating and Air-Conditioning Industry Joint Stock Company** – Isisan Academy Training and Technical Publications.
- **_SEDA-Association of Air-conditioning and Refregeration Training, Consultancy and Research:** Sectoral Trainings, Training of Trainers, common environmental and training programs aimed at NGO and Modernization of VET Sytem in Turkey Project (together with MoNE)
- **_YEM-_zocam** (insulated window) Training Center - Sectoral and Training Institution supported trainings (periodical and delivering certificate)
- **_TK_B**-Union of _stanbul Tekstile Exporters – Istanbul Textile Agency Trainings
- **AHMET YESEV_ UNIVERSITY-TÜRTEP** (Distance-Learning Training Programme with Turkey Turkish) for completing bachelor's degree and M.Sc degree enabling to continue training while working provided at an international level. Engineer Trainings.